
ICANN79 | CF – GAC Community "Open Mic" Work Session
Tuesday, March 5, 2024 – 9:00 to 10:00 SJU

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Hello and welcome to the GAC community open mic session on Tuesday, 5th of March at 13:00 UTC. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN expected standards of behavior. During this session, questions or comments submitted in the chat will be read aloud if put in the proper form. Please remember to state your name and the language you speak in case you will be speaking a language other than English. Please speak clearly and at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation. And please make sure to mute all other devices when you are speaking. You may access all available features for this session in the Zoom toolbar. With that, I will hand the floor over to GAC Chair Nicolas Caballero.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much. Good morning, good morning everyone in the room, and good afternoon, good evening to those online. Welcome to the GAC Open Microphone Session. I'm very pleased to see such a diverse and engaged audience here today. We have government officials, academics, technical experts, and as you already know, business representatives from many different countries and regions. This session is basically an opportunity for you all to share your views, opinions, and questions on the topic of DNS or domain name system.

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

As everybody knows, I don't need to repeat this, but you know, it goes without saying that the DNS is a vital component of the internet infrastructure as it translates domain names into IP addresses and enables the communication between different networks and devices. DNS is also a complex and dynamic field with many challenges and opportunities for innovation, security, governance, and cooperation. That's why we're here today to exchange ideas and perspectives on how to improve and enhance the DNS system for the benefit of all internet users and by the way, to listen, to be on, so to say, on a listening mode to the communities.

In order to make this session productive and respectful, I kindly ask you to follow some three, you know, very simple rules. The first one being please stay focused on the main theme of DNS and avoid any kind of, you know, political, religious, diplomatic, or any kind of internal party kind of thing. This is not the place for such debates. And they will, as a matter of fact, only distract us from the core issues.

Second, please be courteous and respectful to the speakers and the other participants. Please don't interrupt, heckle, or insult even less, right, anyone. Listen attentively and try to understand different points of view. I'm sure we'll have very different points of view about everything. That's for granted, I guess. And finally, please limit your interventions, and this is very important as well, please limit your interventions to no more than two minutes. And make them clear and concise. Please don't repeat what has already been said and try not to go off topic. If you have a question, you know, please make it relevant and specific, you know, and just by following these very simple rules,

we can ensure that this session is valuable and constructive, you know, constructive dialogue for everyone involved.

So again, thank you for your cooperation and attention. I look forward to hearing from you. Let's begin with the experiment. If it all goes well, we might repeat this in Kigali. If it all goes well, we might do it again in Istanbul. I don't know, or even intercessionally. So let's see how it goes. Let's begin. Let me give the floor to Mr. Nigel Hickson for some housekeeping details.

NIGEL HICKSON:

Good morning, everyone. This is an experiment, but it's an experiment in your hands. But I think we had some questions in advance. So are you going to cover those, Nicco?

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Correct, correct. Just let me finish with the session objectives. As you can see on the slides, the session will serve as an open hour where individuals from different constituencies across ICANN community are invited to take the microphone. We will be basically in a listening mode during the session. That is, we won't be able to give you an instant answer. Please don't expect a 30 second reaction to whatever you have to say. We don't mean to preclude anybody from participating or for stating their opinions about whatever in general, provided that is related to the DNS industry or topic. Again, as I said at the beginning of the sessions, we're not here to discuss potential life on Mars or anything like that. So as I said before, please try to stay focused. So with that, let's

open the floor for questions, comments, or anything you would like to mention at this point. Please go ahead.

FARZANEH BADI:

Hello. My name is Farzaneh Badi from the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group. I'm here to tell you a little bit about Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group, and then we can talk about a few issues on GAC. The purpose of the Non-Commercial Stakeholder Group is to represent through its elected representatives the interests and concerns of non-commercial registrants and non-commercial Internet users of generic top-level domains. We defend human rights, such as privacy and freedom of speech at ICANN. Our members include prominent digital rights advocates, not-for-profit technical community, and academics. We bring diversity of opinion, expertise, and regional diversity to ICANN.

We are concerned that the GAC's request for a total confidentiality of law enforcement's access to domain name registrants' personal and sensitive data introduced untransparent practices and make it difficult to hold law enforcement agencies accountable in case of potential abuse of the registration data system. When we ask for confidentiality, we should also ask for due process, and we can discuss what sort of solutions we can come up with to both have transparency and give some confidentiality to the request when needed under exigent circumstances. We believe in mitigating DNS abuse, we should first and foremost focus on fair processes, not violate human rights. Reduction of abuse should not be at the expense of human rights. And our indicators for a good DNS abuse mitigation system should be a

combination of good quality and fair processes and a decrease in DNS abuse.

For public interest commitments, we urge GAC to work with the community to understand the human rights implications of whatever public interest and registry voluntary commitments we want to come up with.

Finally, you're here because you care about the open secure Internet. NCSG urges you to protect that free, open, secure internet within your borders. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you so much, Farzaneh. So, as I said before, we're not supposed to give any immediate, on the spot answer, but again, that doesn't preclude any of the distinguished GAC members, including vice chairs, to give any initial reactions. Is that the case? Do we have any comment? Anything you would like to add to what Madame Farzaneh Badii mentioned? UK, please go ahead.

NIGEL HICKSON:

Yes, good morning. I think it's for others to answer your question in detail. We have indeed asked for confidentiality when it's appropriate. When a request is made where the requester perhaps thinks that for the purpose of the request, if there's a serious incident taking place, then if the details of the request were made public, then it could undermine the law enforcement objectives of that particular incident, but we take your point. But really, I just wanted to thank you and thank the NCUC

over the years. We don't often get the opportunity at the GAC. We thank people that come along to talk to us, but sometimes we don't thank other parts of the community that do such an incredibly worthwhile job, and the NCUC over the years, both in the cross-community working group on accountability and on other issues, has really spearheaded the conscience of ICANN in so many ways. So thanks for the work you do.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you for that. UK, any other reaction? Any other comment? If that is not the case, so thank you again, Farzaneh. So we have Mr. Fabricio Vaira from Perkins Coie, LLP. Please go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Mr. Chair, this is your support staff from the back of the room. You had five people signed up to be speakers ahead of time. Two withdrew, and two have not shown up yet. So the open mic can be a purely open mic, with individuals coming up to the microphone. Otherwise, you don't have anyone who apparently wants to speak this morning.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: What about the person online? We have somebody registered.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: We have him registered, but we have not seen him in the Zoom room yet.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Okay, perfect. So again, the floor is still open. If we don't have any more questions, that means that our experiment was extremely successful, and that we're free to go get some extra coffee, you know, after the salsa night. I'm sorry, I'm sorry, I'm sorry. We have somebody. Benedetta, please go ahead.

UNIDENTIFIED SPEAKER: Well Mr. Chair, what we'd like to do, since there's a little bit of extra time, is perhaps do a short update on the current progress regarding the communiqué, if that would be appropriate from the leadership and the committee perspective.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Absolutely. Sorry, there's somebody. I have Brazil. Brazil, please go ahead.

BRAZIL: Nico, let's say after the open mic session, in understanding that the open mic session is already, I want just to, if you allow me, I had suggested to ask you for a brief moment, just to refer to the NetMundial+10 initiative. I want to take the opportunity and thank you for opening this possibility.

As you know, following the 10 years after the original NetMundial event, there was a milestone in the discussions on governance and other issues in the internet and digital world. Brazil, via our internet steering committee, is promoting, organizing a NetMundial+10 that will take place in April 29 and 30 in Sao Paulo in the Great Hyatt Hotel. The event

is being organized in a multi-stakeholder fashion, so work is ongoing already with some working groups trying to frame a little bit of debate. The focus of the event, as the team describes it, is global challenges for the governance of the digital world and the approach is very much on discussing multi-stakeholder governance model, how this can be improved and reinvigorated in the current circumstances of this renewal and update of the digital agenda. So I just wanted to flag this to our colleagues to invite you to get engaged and invite you to be present in São Paulo if at all possible. We have a specific website that is netmundial.br when you can get more information. I have Renata Mielli here who is the coordinator of the Brazilian Internet Steering Committee. And we are available to any clarifications or comments or anything any member may want to discuss with us. Okay, that's it. Thank you very much for opening the mic.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you very much, Brazil. As a matter of fact, you know, the same logic applies to everyone. Yep, I have a gentleman over there. By the way, before I give the microphone to this gentleman, sorry I can't see your name, I'm absolutely nearsighted. Brazil, I do have some questions. Is the GAC, I mean, are GAC representatives going to get official invitations to NetMundial? Regarding the logistics, you know, and some other details, how are you planning to manage the invitations and our potential participation in NetMundial?

BRAZIL:

Nico, that's a good question. I think it's a good suggestion. We are, of course, the initial approach considering it is a multi-stakeholder event

is to publicize as much as possible and have descriptions and so on. But I think in this case it will be an interesting suggestion that we invite the GAC representatives in a more formal way. So, we take this onboard and we work in this direction. Okay?

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Let me rephrase my question. How do you see the GAC participating in NetMundial? What would be our role, if there's any?

BRAZIL: Nico, I don't think, just take very informally, I'll ask Renata to make her comments as well. We don't see any specific role for the GAC itself. I just take this opportunity being, let's say, the space we are in to draw attention of government representatives to the event. In this case, we are not organizing the event as a government-oriented event, so that's why [CJI] is taking the lead in that process. But governments, as let's say one of the communities in the multi-stakeholder process, are relevant participators in this space. So, we don't see the GAC itself, but wanted to take this opportunity to invite government representatives to join the process.

RENATA MIELLI: I think that it is important that the GAC members participate in NetMundial because the GAC has a very interesting experience in its consensus-based processes with good results by listening and considering the diversity of its members. And this is one of the objectives of our discussion, to improve the multi-stakeholder

processes, focusing on concrete results. And I think then that the contribution of governments that are present here in the GAC session will be very much appreciated.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: And so, before I have this gentleman, sorry, I don't get to see your name. Please state your name and your constituency. And then I have Switzerland and Iran. Please go ahead.

PATRICK PENNINCKX: Hi, good morning. I'm Patrick Penninckx. I'm the head of the Digital Development and Governance Department in the Council of Europe. And I was very much interested in the question or the issue raised by the non-commercial community, in a way, because that's the daily bread, let's say, of the Council of Europe, that is to be able to match between, on the one side, the work, because we're home to the European Convention on Human Rights, but also we're home to the Cybercrime Convention and Data Protection Convention. And in the future, I hope in the very near future, a Convention on Artificial Intelligence. So for us, it is crucial to be able to combine those two interests, that is to keep a clear line on human rights, rule of law, and democracy, while at the same time being able to cater for private companies, but also for the law enforcement community.

And I think the security in the domain name system is essential to be able to provide that. I agree that we need open processes, but we also need to be able to provide access to law enforcement, to be able to, in

the context of criminal offenses, to be able to access data that are important in order to resolve crime. So thank you for that.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much. I have Switzerland. Please go ahead.

JORGE CANCIO: Thank you, Nico. Jorge Gancio, Switzerland, for the record. So first of all, I think this is a good opportunity also to share these kinds of information, like our friends from Brazil have done, so to really update the rest of the committee of things that are of relevance to the rest of colleagues and also of the wider community. So that's the first point.

The second on the intervention from Farzaneh and the reply or the comment from Patrick from the Council of Europe. We, of course, in the GAC have the Human Rights and International Law Working Group. In the past, and I guess still today, there's contacts also with other parts of the ICANN community, but maybe Suada or somebody from our leadership of the Working Group may want to take the floor, because human rights considerations are always very close to our hearts and to our minds. It's something we always have to factor in when we also consider law enforcement activities.

And finally, as a third point, and taking advantage of this exchange format, I wanted to draw the attention of all colleagues and friends that we are co-hosting together with ITU a high-level event that is inserted in the World Summit on Information Society Plus 20, a review process which has started. This high-level event will happen in Geneva at the

end of May, and there are already public invitations available that you can download and you can draw the attention of your ministers, of your colleagues, or of yourselves, if that is a file that is relevant to you. And I will, if my leadership allows me to, I would share this information by email on the GAC list. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Of course, Switzerland, please do so, no problem whatsoever. I have Iran, I have Bosnia and Herzegovina, and I have this gentleman. I can't get to see your name again, my apologies. I'm nearsighted, big time. So Iran, please go ahead.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Thank you very much. Good afternoon, good evening, or good day to everyone. First, a small comment to what Jorge mentioned. The formal invitation to this high-level meeting has been sent to all ministers of communication and whatever name they have already. So the ministers, they have already received the invitation. And also there would be a round table. If any minister would like to attend the round table and contribute in some time allocated to them, a maximum of five minutes, it's already there. So if anyone wants, they could also contact Shah [inaudible] in ITU to get more information.

Now, coming to the NetMundial, yes, that was a successful event that happened immediately after that issue that ICANN decided to transfer the authorities of the supervising the IANA function from the United States administration to public or to the community, so on and so forth. But in my view, we have to be a little bit more careful. NetMundial plus

10, that means we review what we have done in 10 years. It is different from the WSIS, because WSIS has action lines, and these action lines we review every year, and after 10 years we want to see what happens. But I don't believe that there has been any formal review of NetMundial during the last 10 years. So this NetMundial plus 10 and later on NetMundial plus 20 maybe need to be a little bit thought by the distinguished delegation of Brazil to see whether they should have some other reflection instead of NetMundial plus 10 or something else. I don't know, NetMundial plus, NetMundial 2 and so on and so forth. But plus 10 means that we reviewed the 10 years. There has been no process during the last 10 years on NetMundial. That was successful, and we thank Brazil, and we will be happy to attend again. I was attending NetMundial 10 years ago. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you so much for that, Iran, and thanks for being concise and straight to the point. Brazil, would you like to answer to that, or are we okay? Okay, I have this gentleman. Please state your name and your constituency. And then I have Bosnia and Herzegovina. Go ahead, please.

HONG-FU MENG:

Thank you, Chair. Thank you to the GAC leadership, and thank you to GAC members and fellow meeting participants. My name is Hong Fu. I am from NetTalent, and ICANN accredited registrar in Net-Chinese. My point today is on CSAM, which is Child Sexual Abuse Material Online Content Processing. Our entity helps to remove this content to try and protect the children from online harm, and I would like to ask if the GAC

have any idea or have any cooperation thereof to help reporting or help process this type of issues to help protect the current and future youngsters and future generations. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you so much for that. Do we have any reaction to this? Any comment? Anybody would like to take the floor? We don't need to. We don't need to give on-the-spot answers, as I already mentioned many times, but just in case. Nothing prevents us from-- yeah, please go ahead, Patrick.

PATRICK PENNINCKX: Yes. Thank you once again. I just had another question to Brazil, because indeed they did organize the NetMundial 10 years ago, and about a year later organized some kind of a follow-up meeting with leadership. Now, the question is, has there anything been done over those past 10 years, or is this now a rehearse of what has happened 10 years ago?

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you for the question. Brazil, would you like to answer to that?

BRAZIL: Yes. I think we don't want to transform the session, the debate on this, but we are open to discuss this later. Just to say very quickly, the idea is not to, in principle, to revisit whatever happened at the time. It's a little bit to look with fresh eyes 10 years later. As I said, the main focus is to

discuss governance, and within governance how the Multistakeholder Model can be reinvigorated, let's say, in a context where we have a more updated agenda on the internet and the digital, and a lot of important processes going on in different organizations. But we are very keen to discuss this separately and make this discussion. Don't transform the session, the debate on this. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you, Brazil. Thank you, Patrick, for the question. I have Bosnia and Herzegovina.

SUADA HADZOVIC: Hello, everybody. My name is Suada Hadzovic. I'm a GAC representative for Bosnia and Herzegovina, and I am GAC co-chair of Human Rights International Law Working Group. So regarding the human rights, we are continuously working on that issue. So you maybe noticed yesterday during the opening ceremony that we had in one corner sign language interpreters, and we have three rows of representatives of deaf community from Puerto Rico, as we are working on getting information for feasibility analysis of a potential sign language interpretation service during the ICANN public meeting. So we are working always and always on empowering and protection of human rights. Thank you very much.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much, Bosnia. I have a gentleman by the name Gopal Tadepalli. Please go ahead, and then I have Iran.

GOPAL TADEPALLI: Thank you very much. I'm Gopal from India. It's a nice experiment. DNS is essentially an application layer idea. We may not be completely dependent on the data and its confidentiality for enforcement. The range of applications, the dominant applications, and their behavior will let us know what's happening with the DNS. Is any such attempt being made in the enforcement? We don't have to wait for the complete data confidentiality.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you. Thank you for the question, Mr. Tadepali. I have Iran next.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Yeah, thank you very much. I think NetMundial, as I mentioned, was a historic event. It helped a lot the community, but it was organized before the transition and before the ICANN accountability. So one of the items for the process review would be that to what extent the transition. Plus the ICANN accountability workstream one, two, and many others, and GDPR has been successful and what lesson we have learned. This is something very important.

Second, perhaps, the output of the NetMundial, whether you call them report or anything, it had some objectives and some declaration and some requirements. Perhaps it would be good to see to what extent those declaration requirements, objectives, and so on and so forth, has been respected and fulfilled. This is just a food for thought for our distinguished delegation from administration of Brazil. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you for that, Iran. So on the one hand, as Brazil correctly pointed out, we're not here to discuss NetMundial plus 10. But on the other hand, nothing prevents us from asking questions. This is an open microphone session. So sorry about that, Brazil. We're not trying to put you on the spot or anything like that. But it's an open microphone session. So you can expect any kind of question from anybody about any kind of issue, provided it's related to the DNS or to the internet in general. So having said that, please accept my apologies for putting you on the spot on a permanent basis. NetMundial is going to be next month, April 29 and 30. So you're going to be on the spot. That's what I'm saying. So I don't know if you would like to answer anything to the comment from Iran. Please go ahead.

BRAZIL: Thanks so much. And thank you, Iran, for the comments. Again, I would suggest our colleagues to have a look at the documents that have been prepared, that are being prepared and circulated in the web page I mentioned to you, just to bring a little bit of context. I think that's a discussion that is ongoing. And of course, in the preparation of this process, that's something we have been thinking about and thought about how to approach this issue. And I think Iran pointed to some of the main elements of that discussion. If you're looking at an event that happened 10 years ago in a very particular context and was guided by very specific effects that happened at that time. And I think NetMundial at that moment responded as well to the challenges that were present at that time.

And when we started the discussion about organizing that event 10 years later, I think a question that was very much on everybody's minds, well, what's the main objective? To have a look at the principles and the roadmap that was prepared at the time and revisit it and perhaps -- that's something that we think is probably not the best way forward, because that would be very challenging to do, in a way. As I said, I think from a world that mainly, let's say, was focused on Internet governance from a more narrow perspective, and now we see the digital world as something much broader. To make an updating of everything that happened at the time is not something that's very simple to do, and probably wouldn't be easy to do in such a short period of time.

So, of course, NetMundial will be an opportunity to have a dialogue with everything that happened 10 years ago, in terms of the principles that were there, possibly reaffirm those principles or make analysis of -- to what extent they are still valid today, in the same way. But the main focus -- and that will certainly be one of the elements of NetMundial, to allow for this possibility of this dialogue with everything that happened at the time. But the main focus would be on governance in the digital world from a multi-holder perspective, and that's where it is believed contribution could be provided in the current context of the debates that are going on, and be the WISIS+20 or the GDC, and let's say a perception that's an element that where the communities could, let's say, coalesce around and try to find way forwards for the contribution of multi-holder models. So, this is the comment I would make at this point. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much, Brasil. And as a matter of fact, just a comment, right? I mean, being on the spot, I think it's good in terms of marketing for you, so, you know, you should be happy about that. Anyways, I have Egypt. Please go ahead.

CHRISTINE ARIDA: Thank you, Nico. So, thank you, Brazil, for accepting to be on the spot. But I also seriously would like to thank colleagues from Brazil and from Switzerland for doing this update to us here, colleagues. And I think both events are actually happening before the AGM of Kigali. So, I believe Kigali AGM will be a very good opportunity for high-level participants from Brazil and from Switzerland to actually inform other delegates and other high-level participants of whatever is coming out of those two processes. So, thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you, Egypt. The floor is still open. And I guess that given the fact that we don't have that many participants from other constituencies, this is becoming some sort of a GAC family reunion in which we can, you know, take advantage of the opportunity to discuss our internal matters. Again, the floor is open. Any kind of comment, anything you would like to flag at this point, more than welcome. It's an open microphone session. You can talk about anything you want.

For example, I'll just give an example. In Paraguay, and the Paraguayan representative, I don't see the Paraguayan representative in the room, which is something we need to talk about later. But anyways, we're going to be having a LAC IGF event around October or November. I'll

give you the exact dates. And more than welcome, I mean, we'll send invitations and everything. It's more like a regional event, but, you know, everybody is more than welcome to participate on the one hand. And on the other hand, we're also organizing with ICANN.org a DNS forum, which will be happening, if I recall correctly, at the end of July or beginning of August, a DNS forum mainly focused on DNSSEC and other technologies, you know, kind of like a technical thing. Again, everybody more than welcome to participate. I can give details later on. And given the fact that this is an open microphone session, you know, I also wanted to take advantage of the marketing opportunity for those two events in Paraguay. So having said that, the floor is still open. And I see Argentina. Please go ahead.

MARINA FLEGO AIRAS: Good morning, everyone. Well, as regards this forum that you are naming, where it will take place? In Paraguay?

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Correct. Correct. As far as I understand, the capital city, which is Asuncion. Thank you, Argentina. And I have Papua New Guinea. Please go ahead, Russell.

RUSSELL WORUBA: Thank you, Chair, and distinguished colleagues. I wish to take this opportunity again to just update the GAC that Papua New Guinea will be hosting our local DNS forum, just to grow the industry, in the month of May. So we will be involving the sector. This ICANN 79, we had – we're

having two fellows who joined, so our number is growing. We wish to build a momentum and bid to host the Asia-Pacific DNS forum next year. So if anyone is in here from our Asia-Pacific region, and we will be sending an official invite to yourself, Chair, or one of your distinguished vice presidents to be part of us in that. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much for that, Papua New Guinea. I have Egypt. Please go ahead.

CHRISTINE ARIDA: Thank you, Nico. Yes, since this is an open microphone session, I was thinking maybe we can discuss a bit about – we had this discussion yesterday with the NomCom committee on whether we should provide one of our GAC colleagues to participate, and I don't think we gave it enough discussion within the GAC. I don't know if this could be an opportunity to do that or not, but it's up to you, so it's just a suggestion.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much for the suggestion. Would you please repeat, because I didn't hear very well. You're suggesting that we have a discussion now on the NomCom issue, which we started discussing yesterday. Is that correct, Egypt?

CHRISTINE ARIDA: Yes, it's correct, since I think – I had the feeling yesterday, and I stand to be corrected, that we are not in agreement whether there should be

someone participating from the GAC or not, and so I think we could have a discussion about the pros and cons, or – yeah, something like that.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Perfect. Thank you for the suggestion, Egypt. So, again – oh, I see Chinese Taipei and then the UK. Chinese Taipei, please go ahead.

CHINESE TAIPEI: Thank you, Chair. Following all the invitations that we have heard, I also want to share information for you. For the Asia-Pacific Regional Internet Governance Forum, it will be held in Taipei in the week of 19 August, and if everyone in this room is interested, you can contact me or any of our delegation from Taiwan. We are very excited to have the opportunity to hold this event in Taiwan, and actually most of the – for example, the Chair of Taiwan Internet Governance Forum is in this room. Almost all of our higher managers and officers holding this event are here at ICANN79, so every one of you is welcome to approach to us. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much for that. Well noted. I have the UK next.

NIGEL HICKSON: Yes, thank you, Mr. Chairman. Really, I'd just like to thank the contributions that people have made. NetMundial is something which we felt was very important. Indeed, it was an innovative discussion and

a brilliant discussion back in 2014, and I think given the geopolitical situation we are in and the discussions upcoming on the WSIS+20 review process, etc., having another discussion will be very valuable indeed. The WSIS Forum, the high-level event, is something we're paying attention to as well, and thanks, Jorge, for flagging that. There are a whole host of events taking place, of course, and it's worth referencing that the DNS Forum takes place in different parts of the world. There's one in the Middle East, in Morocco coming up in April as well, and of course, regional Internet governance forums, Jorge put on the list the EuroDIG, which is happening, European IGF, which is happening in June as well.

So I think this is turning into a valuable opportunity to exchange sort of information on these sessions, and also thanks for the comments that were made from our colleague from China in terms of CSAM, and I don't think your question was fully answered, but we'll endeavor to come back to you on that point. Thank you. T

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much, UK. So I have Colombia, then I have this gentleman, and I'm sorry, I really can't see your name, and then I have Indonesia. Colombia, please go ahead.

THIAGO DAL-TOE: Many thanks, Chair, and thanks, Nigel. I agree with you that one of the products from this open mic that we weren't expecting was sort of this entire calendar of activities related to Internet governance. And my suggestion, Chair, would be to maybe request the help from the support

staff if we can create a calendar where everyone could put their inputs from their region, and that way we would be creating sort of a GAC additional calendar. It's just a suggestion. Thanks.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you, Colombia. Switzerland, did you want to react to this immediately before I give the floor to this gentleman? So go ahead, please.

JORGE CANCIO: Yes, thank you so much. I think it's a great idea. An idea that others have had in the past, so I was about to share with you the calendar of digital governance and digital policy events at the international level that is maintained by the Geneva Internet Platform, which is run by Diplo Foundation, which is funded to a certain extent by the Swiss government, and I wanted to draw your attention to that resource because you not only have a calendar of events, perhaps not each and every event is covered there, but you also have information on the events, summaries of the sessions, explanation of the issues, etc., so it's a worthwhile resource that is at the disposal and free for all. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much for the ideas, Colombia and Switzerland. And by the way, maybe we can ask GAC support staff to include a direct link, you know, in order to make it easier and straightforward, you know, you just click and get to that page, and another thing would be to include the events in Paraguay, of course. Otherwise, you know, I would

discourage the link. No, I'm joking. I'm joking. I'm joking. So, US, you wanted to react to Colombia and Switzerland's – no? Okay, then I have this gentleman. Sorry to keep you waiting. Please go ahead.

KUO-WEI WU:

Thank you very much. This is Kuo-Wei Wu from the TWNIC, and because I was in the GAC yesterday and listened to the, you know, the [IR] reporting to the GAC, and I find there is some information, I think maybe GAC can improve the, you know, information sharing, you know, such an example of some of the country complain about they run out or they need more IPv4 address, and I'd like to share the experience I have, you know, in my country, you know, and there is if you can turn on the mobile company, you know, running the IPv6, because right now the mobile internet is dominant in the internet traffic. If you turn on the mobile in the IPv6, that means your IPv6 access rate will go up. At the same time, you need IPv4 will go down, you know, and so I believe anybody in here, if your IPv6 access rate is up to the 50%, I think they have many experience can share. If you are the IPv6 access rate under the 30%, should learn the experience from them, and for me, I can share, is talk to your mobile company, turn on the v6, and then you can put your v6 up and you can put the need of the v4 down. So these are my suggestion.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you so very much for that, sir. Any immediate reactions to this? To this very good idea, by the way. Seeing none, let me give the floor to Indonesia. Please go ahead.

ASHWIN SASTROSUBROTO: Thank you, Nico. Ashwin from Indonesia. Just to remind everybody, Indonesia will host the APAC DNS, Asia Pacific DNS next July, so anybody are welcome in Bali. Ah, so you can swim. I would like to invite everybody to swim in Bali. Yeah, in Bali, yes. And this one, and second, I just very interested, I just want to say the first speaker, I forget the name, anyway, she's talking about the –

NICOLAS CABALLERO: The lady or Patrick? Farzaneh?

ASHWIN SASTROSUBROTO: Yeah, Farzaneh, the lady. I mean, she mentioned about very important thing about security and so on, and I think every regulator always have that kind of problems between security and comfortability, between support the whole people or support the industry, you know, that kind of things. And unfortunately in Indonesia you have so many people talking about that, many demonstration about that, and not everybody are talking in accordance to the ICANN standard of behavior. People will always say that, and I think the GAC as regulators have to find out the best way among all those requests from all people. I think that's the point I would like to make. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much, Indonesia, I have the USA and then the Arab League. Please go ahead, USA.

SUSAN CHALMERS:

Thank you, Chair. I just want to acknowledge the suggestion by our colleague from Egypt on the NomCom issue. The United States doesn't have a firm position on this issue, but we would also appreciate a discussion of pros and cons. Just very briefly, I want to note that I thought that the bilateral meeting with the contracted parties house was very interactive and productive yesterday. Mindful of the fact that the GAC is in essence weighing upon matters impacting the contracted parties and what should be in their contracts and what should be consensus policies effectively regulating the contracted parties, it might be useful to consider whether or not we want to start a liaison group with the contracted parties within the GAC to cover the full panoply of issues. So I just wanted to put that out there for consideration by my colleagues. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO:

Thank you so very much for that, USA. I fully agree with the idea. I don't know, but my opinion is irrelevant here. So it's up to you. I think personally, I think it's a very good idea and I would ask GAC support staff to start working towards establishing a liaison with the CPH unless you tell me otherwise. Unless the full GAC tells me otherwise. I don't see any opposition to the idea. Are we okay with that? I personally think it's a good idea, but again, I mean, and let me give the floor to the Arab League and then I have Papua New Guinea and then Iran. Please go ahead.

HAZEM HEZZAH: Hazem from [inaudible] for the record. Following the Middle East DNS forum is happening in Morocco this year, I also want to mention that a global IGF is happening in Saudi Arabia this year too. So it's both in the Arab region.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: On the point, are you going to be sending invitations for our distinguished GAC members or what is the approach for—I understand the global IGF in Saudi Arabia and everything, but what about the Morocco event?

HAZEM HEZZAH: Morocco is the Middle East DNS forum is from ICANN, I think. It's organized by ICANN, not by the Arab League.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you so much. I have Papua New Guinea. Please go ahead.

RUSSELL WORUBA: Thank you, Chair. I just want to make some initial reaction, Chair, to our distinguished colleague who mentioned on the IPv4, IPv6, about two or three speakers past. I think the issue of IPv4, IPv6 transitioning is one that operators need to find business value in doing as much as it is an issue of scalability and services that need to be rolled out. So operators mainly obtain the Internet resources from the RIRs and hence it should be ICANN can best operate or address liaison and discussion and information sharing more constructively at the RIR level when these

discussions are coming forth. For us in the region, APNIC usually have these events around. We have our next one in New Zealand where the Pacific is thinking of having these sort of discussions and information sharing more profoundly. So just some reaction to that, Chair. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you very much for that. Russel. I have Iran.

KAVOUSS ARASTEH: Yes, thank you very much. With respect to liaison group, I think we can discuss the idea and we can further develop that. We could not decide at this meeting. First, discussing with contracting house is a very delicate subject. Many legal issues are there and interest of an entire GAC is in that activities. So we should have first discussed the necessity, the timing of establishing that liaison group, term of reference of liaison group, method of work of liaison group and authority and responsibility of that liaison group if it could represent the entire GAC. Thank you.

NICOLAS CABALLERO: Thank you so much for that, Iran. That goes without saying, as a matter of fact. That's the way we should proceed in all cases. But thank you for pointing that out. Thank you so much. Do we have any other requests for the floor at this point? Any other comment? Any marketing opportunity for your events that you would like to mention at this point?

So if that is not the case, I can give you four minutes of your time back to enjoy this good Puerto Rican coffee. Will that be the case? And I see some nodding. So thank you so much. This was a very good experiment that somehow turned into a brainstorming session. I'm very happy for that. And let's see how it goes in the future. Thank you for your time. The session is closed.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]