
ICANN79 | CF – GAC Capacity Development Workshop (3 of 3)
Saturday, March 2, 2024 – 3:00 to 4:00 SJU

DAN GLUCK:

Hello, and welcome to the ICANN79 GAC Capacity Development Workshop Language Breakout Session on Saturday, 2nd of March 2024 at 19:00 UTC. Please note that this session is being recorded and is governed by the ICANN Expected Standards of Behavior. During this session, questions or comments submitted in chat will be read aloud if put in a proper form. Remember to state your name and the language you will speak in case you will speak speaking a language other than English. Speak clearly and at a reasonable pace to allow for accurate interpretation. Please make sure to mute all other devices when you're speaking. You may access all available features of this session on the Zoom toolbar. With that, I will hand the floor over to Tracy Hackshaw, GAC UPU observer.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much. So, for those who are familiar with the show flow, as we do today, we're going to go into our breakout sessions now. For those who are not familiar, I'm going to explain what that means. And we're going to get some questions being put up on screen now, I think, and you're going to break out into language groups. Right. And I forgot already where the language groups are, but where they are. Well, I believe English is on this side. I believe French, Arabic, and Chinese is on my right. Chinese is there. Spanish is there. English is there. English

Note: The following is the output resulting from transcribing an audio file into a word/text document. Although the transcription is largely accurate, in some cases may be incomplete or inaccurate due to inaudible passages and grammatical corrections. It is posted as an aid to the original audio file, but should not be treated as an authoritative record.

is there as well. Arabic and French. Right? So French, Arabic, English, English, Spanish, Chinese. Right?

So, here's what's going to happen. Those questions are based on the topics from today. As you can see, for your country, what are the key takeaways from today's capacity development presentations? Why it is important to your country and to your region? Have you identified specific challenges or obstacles with respect to any of the topics raised today? And do you have any specific recommendations that can be provided to ICANN to help overcome these challenges? You'll have 30 minutes. These are easy questions. I hope it's not going to take that long to try and drill down on these questions in your native language. Of course, join any group. If you feel more comfortable joining another language group, feel free.

And we're going to sort of monitor, see how things are going. You'll need to appoint at least two people in the group, a leader, team leader of some sort, and a rapporteur. Either or both can report out afterwards, because after the 30 minutes of doing the session, we have a 20-minute reporting session after that. Is that clear? So, each group needs to appoint at least a leader, somebody who can speak or lead the discussion, and a note taker or rapporteur. So, either or both can report out afterwards.

For those in the Zoom room, we're not forgetting you. What's going to happen is that the questions that you're seeing on the screen, we're going to ask that you do the same thing, appoint a team lead and a rapporteur, but we're going to ask that you use the chat to communicate for answering those questions because you will not be

able to talk to each other verbally during the discussion because of the EV challenges. So, we're going to ask that you use the chat. We don't have a moderator, full moderator for that, but someone will be looking at the session in the event that there are some questions that you may have. But there's no official moderator for that session. But you need to appoint in the Zoom room, team lead and a rapporteur.

All right. Any questions? Because I think for those who are familiar, they know the drill. For those who don't know, any questions for those who are new? All right. So, the questions are on screen, and now I invite you to break out into the rooms for 30 minutes. 30 minutes. English, English, Spanish, Chinese, Arabic, French. All right. There's no one in the center. So, if you're still here, that means you haven't broken out as yet into the right group. But those who are still sitting at their desks, it's not encouraged. There are two English groups. The English groups are the front, one on the front there, one on the front there. Yeah. Come on, guys. Those who are sitting at their desk, you're not helping. We're not going to be at the desk. We're at the flip charts. Yeah. Paperless. Paperless. Log on to the Zoom room. You'll see them.

All right. I see people are by the English. Folks, we have 30 minutes, and you are not moving as yet, so it'll be really helpful if we move. That's right. Yeah. Let's go. Spanish. So, I'm hearing there's no Portuguese. I am told that is enough Portuguese in normally is not enough. There's only two people, but now there are a lot of people today. Yes? All the Brazilians are here? So, if Portuguese would like to associate, grab a piece of paper from one of the flip charts. If Portuguese would like to associate together, please join Anna at the front of the room, and she'll lead you into another location. Portuguese. Portuguese corner. All

right. If you want to do Portuguese and Spanish, share the flip chat, and you can share it and go to another corner.

All right. Almost everybody has moved. Almost everybody. English and English are on both fronts. 1 English, 2 English. Flip chart is there. Don't forget you need to appoint a team lead and a rapporteur. Do that first before you begin. 30 minutes ticking away very quickly. All right. Looks like the second English group is still organizing.

All right. I think we've done it. And for folks in the Zoom room, don't forget to appoint a team lead and a rapporteur and using the chat function. Please answer the questions that are on the board. For those who want the copy of the question, I suggest you take a picture of the thing and look at it. Take a photo of the screen and take it back to your group if you need to. All right, folks. Try to wrap up. Final two minutes. Wrap it up. Last points. Begin wrapping up. Two minutes left.

Don't forget to identify your team lead and your rapporteur who's going to take the lead because you'll move immediately to the head table to deliver your final reports. So, team leads, rapporteurs, please get yourselves ready to come to the head table so we can smoothly move to the next session.

GULTEN TEPE:

Thank you, GAC members. Could you please start taking your seats?
Thank you.

TRACKY HACKSHAW: All right, folks. We are starting the rapporteur's reports. Team needs reports now. So please come back to your tables. Please come back your seats. Please come back, and may I ask the rapporteurs or and or team leads to move to the head table, please? So, rapporteurs and or team leads move to the head table to report out.

For the Zoom room, I see there's some inputs from, I believe, it's Armenia and Afghanistan. I'm going to ask if they're willing to report out. And Gulden, maybe you could assist by indicating if they're able to speak and report out. Armenia and Afghanistan. Are all the repertoires and team leads on stage? Doesn't seem so. I would have said If you wish. If you wish. You need to get the team leads and the rapporteurs on the stage at the table, as soon as possible. English group on my right is still working apparently. If this is a test, an exam, I don't know. What do we do? Pens down. Pencils down. Pencils down, please. Thank you.

So, I repeat, all rapporteurs and or team leads for the groups, please come to the front of the room head table to report out. Gulden, would Afghanistan, Armenia, do you think they're going to report out?

GULTEN TEPE: Let me check that, Tracy.

TRACKY HACKSHAW: Sure. Thank you. And if so, they could probably start. So, I'm seeing we have one English group, Arabic, Chinese. It'll be Spanish/Portuguese. Yes. So, we're missing French and the second English group. So, we need French to come forward and the second

English group to come forward. French and second English group. We have very limited time because you have a session after this. So please, guys, let's come forward. Yeah. Gulden, do you think that we have online? No? They're not willing to speak.

All right. So, for those who are in the Zoom room, there are comments and responses from Afghanistan and Armenia. I invite you to read them. They're not willing to speak out loud, so I encourage you to read in the Zoom room. So, let's begin with, I guess let's start with French.

DJIKOLMBAIBET KENNEDY:

As for the Francophone group, we have thought about the 4 items. And drawing on this morning's workshop, we have come up with a number of ideas, specifically with regards to identifiers. I believe that this was now better understood by all participants. We also found that AfriNIC was a bit absent, if not totally and utterly silent. This means that some of the activities carried out and the progress made is not visible. We also found that participants have a better view of the roles played by regional registries, but also, the different roles played by other actors.

As for IPv4 and IPv6, the migration is being delayed on the African continent. We should review our approaches, specifically for the countries who are already exploiting and harnessing the IPv6. The African continent is still working with IPv4, and it is, to a certain extent, underexploited. Someone was saying this morning that some addresses are illegally sold to countries that still require IPv4, and this is a matter of concern for us. I believe we should look to come up with forums in order to better discuss this and to have a clearer path for our

communities. We talk about One World, One Internet, and this is our motto at the ICANN. Thank you very much.

TRACKY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much the French group and Chad. Let's move. I'm not sure if it's Portuguese or Spanish or both, but certainly, please proceed, Brazil.

BRAZIL:

Thank you, Tracy. I'll just make the introduction in Portuguese to explain that you put it very well when you said that our group is Spanish/Portuguese. We had three Spanish native speakers and five Portuguese native speakers. Or four if you consider Thiago is a Brazilian represents the Colombian government. So, I'll take that to switch to Portuguese and make my presentation in Portuguese as I'm not a great Spanish speaker. Okay?

What we discussed in the group is that the three main topics that drew our attention was the IPv6 in a general way with regards to its adoption and mainly reviewing it and looking at as far as the security that IPv6 offers and its advantages compared to IPv4. Also, regarding universal acceptance, that was another topic that was interesting to us. And the ccTLD and its origins and each one of the international situations with regards to the ccTLDs were also discussed. Since everything is interconnected, I'm going to approach these topics in a general way.

Each country has its own peculiarity. However, the discussion in our group was mainly regarding the international matters as far as each one

of the assignments for ccTLD. In the beginning, this was done in a very informal way. And then later, it was consolidated within each country, and there are main differences. For example, in Brazil, there's a multi-sectorial management. And also in Colombia, there's governmental management. Sometimes, countries have a private management with their ccTLDs. And that can also be seen when IPv6 is adopted.

We also spoke about how many countries, specifically, I think Colombia, they passed a law in which adopting IPv6 was mandatory. But other countries don't have this possibility. So, we spoke a lot about that subject matter, how to incentivize adopting IPv6 while IPv4 still has very good functioning. It's not a matter of replacing. It's so that both versions or both standards can be used together.

And we also spoke about the standards that would force the use of IPv6 compared to a voluntary use of it and how to incentivize that voluntary use. With regards to the recommendations that were said or what can be done so that ICANN can improve the policies in a general way. We also spoke about these recommendations with regards of how to manage the ccTLDs for each country, especially for developing countries. For example, with regards to costs offerings where we can support these countries and these countries where this still is impossible.

We also spoke about the ICANN criteria so that that type of jurisdiction can be accepted within the ccTLD. Because as we spoke before, no matter how much a country passes a law with regards to this or organizes the adoption of the IPv6 or the ccTLDs in their country, that doesn't mean that ICANN will accept that policy internationally because

ICANN follows the defined criteria of ISO. That's why the recommendation that we spoke about is that ICANN can be flexible with these acceptance requirements with regards of what each country recommends and how each country would like to deal with this IPv6 and IPv4 topics. For us, it's very important to incentivize the adoption of the IPv6.

And with regards to security, I would also like to point out that this is also an ever more relevant topic in our countries. And since IPv6 is becoming more popular within the IP base, we would like to also realize that there are threats and attacks to the Internet. Thank you very much.

TRACKY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much. Now we only have 10 minutes according to my watch, so I'm going to ask the remainder of the groups to really be as concise as possible. We're still missing the second English group. I don't know where they are. And there's also one online person that wishes to speak. So, keep that in mind. China? Chinese language. Sorry.

TOM:

Hello. Good day, everyone. This is Tom speaking for the Chinese language group. I represent the Chinese and Latin accredited registrar here for the Chinese speaking group. I want to say for our takeaways, I want to start with appreciating the IANA function for its rapid update and responses and smooth procedures, allowing us to update registries and zones and files in a smooth manner. And secondly, IPv6 is an important topic for us. Even though we have a high, mobile device

adoption, but our fixed networks are still having difficulties to increase adoption with the fixed network systems. So, we would like to encourage ICANN and the RIR to share their experiences and how they're able to promote IPv6 adoptions worldwide.

And then next with regard to the UA and IDN, we and the CJK group uses the Han character systems, which uses phonics systems which we have to type and then the system will translate that into the Han characters. And then when we input that into emails, the system still had to further translate that into the Punycode system. This multiple layer and complex transitions poses technical complexity of its own. Therefore, we would like to encourage ICANN and the relative groups to promote the use of IDN further so that these becomes more populated and flourished. Thank you. This is our brief sharing.

TRACKY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much, Chinese speaking group. Thank you. We move to Arabic speaking now. Christine?

CHRISTINE ARIDA:

Thank you. And I will speak in Arabic. We had four representatives from the Arabic speaking countries who represent three countries and government organizations. And we had agreed on three points in the two fields. One, in the domain systems and the Internet addresses. Regarding the domain system, we concluded that we have to engage representatives from the government in the GAC, and we have to engage them in the system of the ccTLD for the country level. And in this context, we have to lay clear guidance and regarding the national

consultations that should be done in order to reach a national consensus about the re-specialization.

Regarding the Internet addresses, there is something that should be discussed regarding the mechanisms for special policies relating to IP addresses. And that should be discussed in the meetings that GAC holds so that we can benefit from the government representatives in solving the problems that could arise in some of the geographical locations concerning the RIR assistance. And regarding these two points, we agreed that there is a need for coordination between GAC and the international fora within ICANN such as the ccNSO, ASO in order to formulate reference documents that can be a guidance regarding the redistribution or the distribution of numbers and systems. Thank you.

TRACKY HACKSHAW: Thank you very much, Arabic speaking group. Let's move now to, I guess, English speaking group 1 or 2, pending.

NIGEL CASSIMIRE: Well, we are the first one, so I guess we are number one. In this English-speaking group, we had representatives from seven countries in the Caribbean, Europe, and Africa. And key takeaways for us from the program this morning, I think we could say it focused on the operations of ccTLDs and strengthening these ccTLDs. Of special interest was the initiative here in Puerto Rico of .pr. And the reason for that is because there was a felt need to increase local usage of the country code top-level domains for several reasons. And Pablo mentioned the disaster resilience aspect, for example, and that certainly made a big impression

on our group members as well. We also had a lot of discussion. Well, not a lot, but some discussion as well on strengthening the universal acceptance aspects and how could the country code top-level domains of particular programs or initiatives be used to encourage use of local scripts within the local ccTLDs as well.

In terms of IPv6 deployment, it was also felt that the ccTLDs could be useful in spurring the adoption of IPv6 by doing particular local campaigns. Looking forward now, we thought of the upcoming gTLD next round and realized that there's an opportunity to figure out how do we build the capacity that's needed in local communities, especially underserved local communities to understand and exploit the opportunities coming from this next round of gTLDs. So, that's probably something we could look in terms of developing going forward. Also, in looking in terms of developing going forward is facilitating the process of reallocation of ccTLDs. I thought in Brazil and the Caribbean, we might have had those problems, but certainly from the group, there are other parts of the world as well that are experiencing that.

And finally, we felt in terms of recommendations that we ought to be looking for and developing opportunities to address education needs on IPv6, IPv6 deployment, and more generally, other aspects of ICANN so that in the individual countries, people can better understand what ICANN does, and maybe we could help raise the profile of ICANN. So, a bit of outreach is required in that area as well. So, thank you very much.

TRACKY HACKSHAW: Thank you very much, Nigel. English group 1. English group 2, very, very quickly.

GLORIA ATWINE KATUUKU: Thank you very much. We had German, India, Japan, the ASO, Uganda, Bangladesh, among others in our group. And one of the takeaways from today's, we noted the transfer of ccTLDs, its policy requirements, and the operational procedures. Noting that while all this is important, we have to make sure that there's multi-stakeholder engagement, and at the top of it all is stability, as we talk about transposed ccTLDs.

We noted the operational procedures, especially with respect to .pr, it's the role of registry operating ccTLDs in the event of natural disasters, a takeaway for all of us, in our respective regions. We noted the governance models of ccTLDs, and the fun part of it is, while all these procedures are, you cannot just transfer because of your government. The topic was very important to us, especially, we noted the sovereignty of a country code top-level domain name, and then, referencing the various laws and regulations that are in place for each event to be part of white sovereign. And we note that why it's important is, how do we avoid monopoly of ccTLDs? Why it is important, further is the transition from IPv4 to IPv6 at the center of it all, noting and curbing DNS abuse in today's discussions. The different ways governments can manage IP addressing systems were some of the things highlighted for today's topic.

And looking at what are the challenges identified, one of the challenges is the network address translation, which has come out as key. And then the other challenge is that with the challenge such, okay, the

searching for technical providers, on knowing which company is running IPv6 or vis a vis IPv4. This has been one of the challenges identified. With the specific to recommendation, DNS at all levels should be highlighted at a country code top-level domain. At all levels, DNS should be observed. And then one of the other things that we recommended is there should be an uptake of RPKI to avoid multiuse of IP addresses. And that is it. Thank you.

TRACKY HACKSHAW: All right. Thank you very much. And may I beg the indulgence of the interpreters for just allowing our remote participant to intervene and have their say in their group. Gulten, maybe you can introduce to us.

GULTEN TEPE: Thank you, Tracy. We have Kristina Hakobyan from Armenia delegation.

KRISTINA HAKOBYAN: Hello, again, everyone. We had a small discussion in the room, a room chat. I mean, Zoom chat. I'm sorry. So, it is very interesting that the different registries have the same approaches to the questions you have raised. So, for the first question, we were talking about the technical infrastructure, about cybersecurity threats, policy development, and DNS abuse prevention. Then for the second question, which are the important, why these key takeaways are important for our country. This is about the effectiveness that domain registry about domain

registry management effectiveness, and it is also a fundamental for the stability, security, and usability of any ccTLD.

Some challenges which is connected with the ccTLDs is limited recognition in comparison with gTLDs and also the global competition. It is also about other than ccTLDs, which are more spread all over the world than ccTLDs and internationalization, which means that not only the citizens or people are speaking this language or maybe informed about this ccTLD are registering. So, the registry should be open for all over the world.

And then what about any specific recommendations? It is about addressing challenges, to have a compressive approach, to collaborate with other stakeholders, continuous monitoring of industry threats, and implementing strategic initiatives to have enhanced resilience and competitiveness which is connected with all ccTLDs, but I was speaking about .am registry. So, that was our concerns. Thank you.

TRACY HACKSHAW:

Thank you very much. I'd like to thank all groups for their contributions. Really, really valuable and important. I hope you learned a lot from this session. And thank you once again. Thank you very much. Over to you, Karel.

KAREL DOUGLAS:

Thank you, Tracy. And I know we are over time, so please bear with me while I thank the speakers for today. And of course, Ashwin, you want to applaud? We'll do it at the end. The speakers, the GAC leadership of

course, Nico, who came this morning and opened this session. The GAC support staff, fantastic, Julia and co, Daniel and others. The technical staff and the translators, of course, thank you so much for bearing with us. I know we have gone overtime on each occasion, but thank you. And of course, you all, the members of the committee who we do this for.

The questionnaire, we will have a questionnaire. The questionnaire will allow us to have feedback from you to see how we could improve what we are doing. And as a matter of fact, I did take some notes from the presentations of things that we could do better already, and even the substantive issues I will undertake that we will send that to the GAC leadership so the GAC leadership could also look at some of these issues that you brought back to us.

Of course, tomorrow, I believe there is a meeting with the ASO. Correct me if I'm wrong. And a lot of these same issues will be dealt with, so I'm inviting you again to be there. And if you have questions that weren't answered, by all means, tomorrow we'll have an opportunity. So, I think that is it, Tracy. Thank you so much. A fantastic colleague and others, Susan as well, all everybody who has contributed to this fantastic workshop. So, thank you, and have a wonderful evening. Be back in the room at 4:15, I believe, for the high-level government meeting. Thank you so much.

[END OF TRANSCRIPTION]